## Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc.

# Comparison of Workers' Compensation Rates Effective December 1, 2011

## Six Selected Northeastern States



**April 16, 2012** 

#### **Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc.**

Comparison of Rates: Delaware to Other Northeast States
Delaware December 1, 2011 Rating Values

Discussion of workers compensation systems often includes claims or assertions regarding the relative premium costs for this line of insurance in various state jurisdictions. The Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc. ("DCRB") is mindful that true premium costs for workers compensation insurance in different states are the result of many variables not generally susceptible to simple or generalized analysis. Especially important variables of this type include differences in classification plans approved in different states and competitive pricing differentials applied by insurance carriers in each jurisdiction. As a means of informing various parties interested in, subject to and/or participating in the Delaware workers compensation system regarding comparative system costs, the DCRB has previously produced studies which compared approved rates in several selected northeastern states to those of Delaware. The most recent such study was dated March 14, 2011 and reflected rating values effective December 1, 2009 using an approach which recognized both of these notable variables.

The DCRB has updated its prior study to recognize the revised residual market rates and voluntary market loss costs that were adopted in Delaware effective December 1, 2011. The results of that update are presented and discussed in this report.

NOTE: Delaware's Chancery Court issued a decision, Memorandum Opinion and Order dated July 24, 2009 requiring carriers to reduce December 1, 2011 rating values by an additional five percent of December 1, 2008 Rating Values to reflect savings accruing on open medical claims that occurred prior to the implementation of the medical fee schedule on May 24, 2008. The Delaware rating values reflected in this study include the effect of the Chancery Court Decision.

Workers compensation insurance prices are commonly established within the context of statutory and administrative systems which provide substantial flexibility and diversity to participants in the marketplace. In Delaware, one aspect of this flexibility is that significant numbers of insurers have historically elected not to adopt, or have adopted on a deferred basis, revised DCRB loss costs once approved by the Department of Insurance. Thus, the reader should be aware that some carriers, and potentially many carriers, may either not have completed their individual evaluation of those recently revised rating values and market conditions in order to adjust their own prices if and to the extent they may ultimately find appropriate, or may have elected not to adopt the most recent DCRB loss costs.

In order to prepare this report, the DCRB has used the prevailing loss cost multipliers for each Delaware insurer as of February 24, 2012 together with the approved voluntary market loss costs effective that same date. Further, the DCRB has verified that the carrier(s) thus establishing the "low" and "high" Delaware rates used in this study had adopted DCRB loss costs at least for their January 1, 2012 pricing. In some cases, however, carriers had <u>not</u> in fact adopted the approved DCRB December 1, 2011 loss costs as of the date of this report. Individual carriers currently so positioned may or may not adopt the most recently approved DCRB loss costs. Further, such carriers may revise their loss cost multipliers to some extent if and when they do elect to make such an adoption. As a consequence the DCRB views the indications of this specific analysis as subject to ongoing change as market conditions and competitive circumstances evolve.

#### **OVERVIEW OF STUDY RESULTS**

- Delaware lowest approved rates for the classifications studied tended to be lower than the
  lowest rates for New Jersey and Pennsylvania. Delaware lowest rates tended to be higher
  than the lowest rates in Maryland, Virginia and West Virginia. Delaware highest rates were
  lower than that of Maryland, New Jersey and Pennsylvania. Delaware highest rates were
  higher than that of West Virginia and Virginia with the exception of contracting classifications
  for each of the two states.
- In addition to the rating values shown in Exhibits 1 and 3, the final costs to policyholders
  may be significantly influenced by various assessments and/or surcharges that are
  applicable to premiums rather than rates. The following list shows additional costs that apply
  to premiums rather than rates for the states included in this study.

Delaware – None

Pennsylvania - Employer assessment factor 2.25%

Maryland – Premium Tax 2.0%, Subsequent Injury Fund 6.5%, Uninsured Employers Fund 2.0% and Workers Compensation Commission Tax 0.02%

New Jersey – Plan Premium Adjustment Program (assigned risk) minimum surcharge 15%, Second Injury Fund 7.82% and Uninsured Employers Fund 0.17%

West Virginia – Regulatory Surcharge 5.5%, Premium Tax 4.0% (waived while Deficit Reduction Surcharge is being charged), Premium Tax Surcharge 0.55% and Deficit Reduction Surcharge 9.0%

Virginia - None

- This study was limited by design to a comparison of approved carrier rates in the selected jurisdictions. Such rates exclude potential effects of a broad variety of special rating programs which may be available in some jurisdictions. Thus, this study is directed at the benchmark tabular rates used by insurers as a starting point in determining final premiums but has not analyzed the complex series of possible additional steps which may actually apply in determining each insured's policy premium. As examples of such additional factors, Delaware employers may qualify for some or all of the following special pricing programs:
  - Workplace Safety Program credits premised upon physical inspection of workplace conditions and safety measures in effect in the employer's business.
  - Construction Classification Premium Adjustment Program credits which recognize effects of significant differences in wage levels between employers on workers compensation insurance premiums.

- Schedule Rating credits or debits applied based on an individual insurer's assessment of features of an employer's business which may differ from the usual circumstances expected in a given business enterprise.
- Retrospective rating plans which effectively rely on the insured's own loss experience in determining final insurance prices.
- Deductible coverage which allows employers to reduce their workers compensation insurance premiums in return for accepting responsibility for initial payments on claims which may occur for their employees.
- Each jurisdiction studied showed substantial ranges of approved rates within many given Delaware classifications. These ranges of approved rates are attributable in part to differences in carrier pricing initiatives and values such as deviations or loss cost multipliers, and/or to differences in the structure of approved classifications which cause parts of multiple different classifications in some states to be equivalent to parts of a single common classification in Delaware. Competitive differences in carrier pricing programs are applicable in deriving comparisons of Delaware rates to those of Maryland, Pennsylvania and Virginia and in fact produce very significant ranges of carrier rates even within Delaware itself for any given classification. Differences in classification plans apply in the comparisons with all states except Pennsylvania which uses a classification system identical to that of Delaware for the classifications included in this study.
- While rate comparisons often include statements to the effect that "state X rates are "blank" percent higher (or lower) than those of state Y", this study did not produce single factors for comparison of rates between states. Actually deriving such point estimates would require a significant amount of detail not generally available for analysis. To accurately establish rate differences in this fashion would require separate exposure data, within a state, consistent with the approved classification plan(s) of any other state(s) being included for comparison, and separately reported for each carrier using different rate levels (i.e., rate deviations or loss cost multipliers). Without such information, the proper weights cannot be determined for purposes of computing average rates in each state, and without benefit of these appropriate weights, averages or other similar statistics taken from different states must be viewed with caution.

#### STRUCTURE OF THE STUDY

For purposes of this study approved rates and related values were determined as nearly as possible for the effective date of December 1, 2011. In general, the comparable loss costs, rates and/or other rating values pertinent in the other states included in this study initially became effective some time subsequent to December 1, 2011 but remained in effect as of the date of this comparison. Readers of this report should be aware that subsequent revisions in loss costs, rates or rating values will periodically occur in the various states included in this study subsequent to December 1, 2011.

Because the DCRB wanted to be able to comprehensively and correctly identify and account for differences in classification plans in this study, our analysis was limited to certain selected Delaware classifications. In determining which classifications to include in its annual report, the

DCRB selected ten (10) classifications from each of the three traditional "Industry Groups" commonly used in workers compensation pricing analysis: Manufacturing, Contracting and Other Industries. The classifications so selected were the largest Delaware classifications in each Industry Group as measured by "expected losses", a statistic derived by multiplying recent exposures (generally payrolls) times the currently-approved DCRB loss cost values by classification. Based on the most recent available data, the thirty (30) classifications included in this analysis account for over 47 percent of total Delaware expected losses and over 57 percent of total Delaware payrolls.

In order to compare Delaware rates to any other jurisdiction(s), a cross-reference between the classification plans used in Delaware and the comparison state(s) was needed. Development of such a cross-reference involved a thorough review of classification manuals provided by each other jurisdiction included in this comparison, and required a significant effort by an expert member of the DCRB staff. Cross-references were developed for the following states: Maryland, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Virginia and West Virginia, states located in close geographic proximity to Delaware. As was the case in preparing previous studies, a draft of this study has been provided to each contributing jurisdiction for review and comment as a means of verifying the accuracy of information included herein.

Exhibit 1 attached presents the ranges of approved rates by state in any classification(s) part or all of which correspond to the indicated Delaware classifications studied. Where a state has more than one classification applicable to part(s) of a given Delaware classification, all such classifications are listed in numerical order on successive lines of the exhibit within the Delaware code of interest.

While some comparisons can be made on a "one-for-one" basis, it can be readily seen that review of many classifications requires recognition of multiple classifications in other jurisdictions. In an extreme case (Delaware classification code 454 as compared to Maryland) another state has nine (9) classifications with some component(s) in common with a single Delaware classification.

In reviewing Exhibit 1, care must be taken to recognize the purpose and inherent limitations on the information as presented. Classifications shown for each state have been grouped within the pertinent Delaware classifications. The classifications shown for states other than Delaware have NOT necessarily been aligned to allow line-by-line comparisons of classifications and rates between those other states independent of Delaware. For example, while code 4717 is applicable to part of the Delaware code 104 in Maryland and code 4825 is applicable to part of Delaware code 104 in West Virginia, code 4717 in Maryland is not identical to code 4825 in West Virginia.

Exhibit 2 attached provides general definitions of each code number presented on Exhibit 1 by state, for purposes of clarification and understanding of the various elements of this study. In addition to the specific separations of various types of businesses between classifications noted on Exhibit 2, the reader should be aware that the West Virginia classification system generally requires the inclusion of such activities as clerical office and sales employees in each field of business classification. Other states generally provide for "standard exceptions" which allow reporting of these activities in separate and generally lower-rated classifications provided certain conditions are met.

Delaware, Maryland, Pennsylvania, Virginia and West Virginia all have workers compensation pricing laws which require insurance carriers to establish independent loss cost multipliers or other similar parameters in order to derive their own approved rate schedules. Thus, for each of these states a "low" and a "high" rate was derived in each classification. These rates reflect the extreme range of approved carrier rating values in each state as provided to the DCRB. While the DCRB cannot determine the extent to which carriers with these extreme values have written business in each of the classifications studied, the ranges shown do reflect the potential variation of prices in each jurisdiction owing to competitive factors. The bases for the ranges as shown are set forth briefly below:

<u>Delaware</u>: Loss Cost Multipliers Approved Range from 0.8980 to 2.3700

Approved Loss Costs Effective December 1, 2011

Maryland: Loss Cost Multipliers Approved Range from 0.8910 to 2.5350

Approved Loss Costs Effective January 1, 2012

**Note**: For Maryland, the rating values for the Injured Workers Insurance

Fund (IWIF) were not available for this study.

Pennsylvania: Loss Cost Multipliers Approved Range from 0.9000 to 2.5590

Approved Loss Costs Effective April 1, 2012

Virginia: Loss Cost Multipliers Approved Range from 1.000 to 2.3660

Approved Loss Costs Effective April 1, 2012

West Virginia: Loss Cost Multipliers Approved Range from 0.7330 to 1.9450

Approved Loss Costs Effective November 1, 2011

As of January 1, 2012 New Jersey does not allow carriers to deviate from the approved New Jersey Bureau rates in the voluntary market. Thus, there is no variation in price from carrier to carrier. Thus, the only variation in approved rates within a given Delaware classification are due to differences in classification definitions.

Exhibit 3 attached summarizes results from Exhibit 1 and shows the extreme range of prices approved in each state for types of businesses subject to each Delaware classification included in this study. For the states of Delaware and Pennsylvania (having the same classification plan for the types of businesses addressed in this comparison) these ranges are the result of differences in competitive carrier pricing programs. For the remaining states as compared to Delaware, these extremes include the effects of both competitive pricing and classification differences where applicable. For each grouping of classifications (Manufacturing, Contracting and Other Industries) and for all studied classifications combined, averages of the low and high rates have been computed using Delaware payrolls as weights.

The DCRB would emphasize that while the weighting system used on Exhibit 3 provides a means of combining the various endpoints observed for approved rates falling within specified Delaware classifications in other jurisdictions, the "average" values shown would NOT represent averages for those other states themselves. This difference is attributable to the matter previously discussed regarding proper exposure weights and the fact that the DCRB does not generally have other states' exposure data separately for the parts of classifications pertinent to this study.

#### INTERPRETATION OF STUDY RESULTS

To the extent that prevailing differences in rates are discovered in a study such as this one, questions often arise as to why such differences persist. The DCRB would suggest that state-to-state differences arise between workers compensation insurance rates primarily because each jurisdiction separately establishes benefits and administrative procedures pertinent to this line of business, and each state's workers compensation system must interact with different industrial, economic and social climates. In short, workers compensation insurance costs more where losses and insurer expenses are higher, and less where losses and insurer expenses are lower. It is not generally the case that differences in insurance cost are attributable to differences in insurance carrier requirements for operating margins or profits. Further, each carrier is likely to have consistent objectives in managing and paying claims in various jurisdictions, subject to the specific constraints and requirements of each administrative system. In fact, many of the same insurance carriers actively write workers compensation business in more than one of the states subject to this study.

It is beyond the scope of this study to definitively establish and/or quantify reasons for the observed differences in workers compensation rates between the jurisdictions addressed herein. In its previous rate comparison studies, however, the DCRB offered some general observations in order to illustrate the kinds of differences which may arise between different state workers compensation systems.

- The Delaware maximum indemnity benefit is set at two-thirds of the Statewide Average Weekly Wage (SAWW). Other states' maximum benefit may be set at another level of SAWW or a set dollar amount. In addition, the SAWW can vary widely from state to state so that states with the same benefit percentage may have significantly different benefit amounts.
- Delaware has a medical fee schedule in place. Other states may not have a fee schedule or may have fee schedules in place, although the schedules may be based on reimbursement rates that differ significantly from state to state.
- Delaware does not specify the use of the AMA Guide to the Evaluation of Permanent Impairment in the evaluation of permanent disability. Other states may use this guide.
- Delaware does not allow offsets for unemployment benefits, Social Security old age benefits and employer funded pension benefits. Other states may allow for benefit offsets or may allow them at varying levels.
- Delaware allows an employee to have free choice of physician. Practices in this regard vary greatly by state, with some allowing employee choice of physician for the life of the claim or for a certain amount of time after the injury.
- Delaware provides no scheduled or pre-funded cost-of-living adjustment for indemnity benefits. Some states do provide such adjustments for certain types of injuries.

• In Delaware, permanent partial and temporary total disability benefits are payable for the duration of disability without limitation. Other states may have different maximum payment levels and/or duration of payments for these types of benefits.

The above observations identify provisions of the Delaware Workers Compensation system and offer alternative provisions that directly influence the cost of insurance in other states and any comparison to Delaware costs. The points noted may produce either lower or higher insurance costs and, therefore, lower or higher insurance rates in a jurisdiction than in Delaware. It must be recognized that many system differences (indeed a great majority of such differences which exist) are omitted entirely from these brief illustrative references. Finally, significant system differences are often manifest in controlling judicial decisions and administrative procedures.

Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc.
Rating Value Comparison - 30 Selected Delaware Classifications

Exhibit 1

Rating Value Comparison - 30 Selected Delaware Classifications																				
DE Class Code	DE Description	12/11 Loss Cost	Rang DE Rates as Low		MD 1/12 Class Loss Code Cost	MD Rates as	ge of s of 1/1/12 High		Approved NJ Rates 1/1/12	PA 4/12 Class Loss Code Cost		ange of as of 4/1/12 High	VA Class Code	4/12 Loss Cost		inge of as of 4/1/12 High	WV Class Code	Approved WV 11/11 Loss Costs		ange of s as of 11/1/11 High
Grou	ıp I: Ten (10) Manufac	turing (	Classifications	3																
104 Food	Sundries Mfg., NOC	3.21	2.88	7.61	4717 2.93 4825 0.73 6504 1.66 8102 2.01	2.61 0.65 1.48 1.79	7.43 1.85 4.21 5.10	2150 4627 4628 6504 8102	10.86 3.72 1.99 4.04 3.57	104 3.03	2.73	7.75	2055 4717 4825 6504	0.99 1.39 0.82 1.99	0.99 1.39 0.82 1.99	2.34 3.29 1.94 4.71	4825 6504 8102	1.81	0.48 1.33 1.33	1.28 3.52 3.54
112 Beve	erage Mfg.	8.04	7.22	19.05	2157 5.34	4.76	13.54	2156 2157	9.37 20.53	112 9.99	8.99	25.56	2157	4.00	4.00	9.46	2157	4.68	3.43	9.10
222 Plas	tic Articles Mfg, NOC	3.62	3.25	8.58	4431 1.44 4452 2.28 4459 3.66 4470 1.83 4484 2.48	1.28 2.03 3.26 1.63 2.21	3.65 5.78 9.28 4.64 6.29	4431 4452 4459 4470 4484	9.99 5.73 6.84 5.62 5.30	222 2.82	2.54	7.22	4431 4452 4459 4470 4484	1.11 2.08 1.82 2.48 1.65	1.11 2.08 1.82 2.48 1.65	2.63 4.92 4.31 5.87 3.90	4452 4459 4484	1.93	1.57 1.41 1.58	4.16 3.75 4.20
227 Oilcle Cork	oth, Linoleum & Mfg.	2.68	2.41	6.35	4493 1.76	1.57	4.46	4491 4493	4.15 9.06	227 3.89	3.50	9.95	4493	1.83	1.83	4.33	4493	2.12	1.55	4.12
406 Rollii Meta	ng Mill - Ferrous Ils	4.29	3.85	10.17	3018 3.28 3241 2.48	2.92 2.21	8.31 6.29	3018 3241	6.94 10.06	406 4.85	4.37	12.41	3018 3241	3.56 2.03	3.56 2.03	8.42 4.80	3018	2.29	1.68	4.45
411 Stee	l Fabricating	8.13	7.30	19.27	3030 6.63	5.91	16.81	3028 3030 3040 3041	4.56 16.66 15.14 4.26	411 5.06	4.55	12.95	3030	7.06	7.06	16.70	3030	4.95	3.63	9.63
413 Iron	Works	5.78	5.19	13.70	3040 6.02 3042 4.74	5.36 4.22	15.26 12.02	3030 3040 3042	16.66 15.14 9.97	413 5.29	4.76	13.54	3040 3042	4.75 2.96	4.75 2.96	11.24 7.00	3040	4.50	3.30	8.75
	et Metal Products - Shop	5.27	4.73	12.49	3064 3.31 3069 3.66 3169 2.41 3220 2.15 3224 2.75 3227 2.53 3400 2.45 3803 2.01 3807 2.22	2.95 3.26 2.15 1.92 2.45 2.25 2.18 1.79 1.98	8.39 9.28 6.11 5.45 6.97 6.41 6.21 5.10 5.63	3045 3066 3075 3076 3169 3220 3227 3400 3807	11.10 6.60 6.60 6.86 6.99 5.21 4.24 5.28 3.40	454 3.21	2.89	8.21	3064 3076 3169 3220 3224 3227 3400 3803 3807	3.08 2.14 2.09 2.01 2.01 2.25 2.98 2.72 1.87	3.08 2.14 2.09 2.01 2.01 2.25 2.98 2.72 1.87	7.29 5.06 4.94 4.76 4.76 5.32 7.05 6.44 4.42	3064 3069 3169 3220 3224 3227 3400 3807	4.82 2.57 1.71 2.30 2.86	2.41 3.53 1.88 1.25 1.69 2.10 1.91 1.31	6.40 9.37 5.00 3.33 4.47 5.56 5.08 3.48
581 Oil R	efining	1.72	1.54	4.08	2305 1.88 4459 3.66 4557 1.29 4740 2.52 4741 2.50 4751 1.59	1.68 3.26 1.15 2.25 2.23 1.42	4.77 9.28 3.27 6.39 6.34 4.03	2420 4459 4712 4740 4741 4829	13.13 6.84 3.57 1.10 3.22 3.53	581 2.13	1.92	5.45	2305 4459 4557 4740 4741 4751	1.47 1.82 1.18 1.26 1.49 1.58	1.47 1.82 1.18 1.26 1.49 1.58	3.48 4.31 2.79 2.98 3.53 3.74	2305 4459 4557 4740 4741	1.93 1.33 1.45	1.60 1.41 0.97 1.06 1.19	4.24 3.75 2.59 2.82 3.17
759 Cabl	e Television Operators	3.07	2.76	7.28	6325 6.29 7600 2.44 7601 3.19	5.60 2.17 2.84	15.95 6.19 8.09	6325 7600 7601	6.84 5.75 6.07	759 5.00	4.50	12.80	6325 7600 7601	4.04 1.93 4.18	4.04 1.93 4.18	9.56 4.57 9.89	6325 7600 7601		3.41 1.72 3.47	9.04 4.55 9.22

Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc. Exhibit 1 Rating Value Comparison - 30 Selected Delaware Classifications

			realing v	alue Compan	3011 - 30 36160	Jieu Delawai	ie Ciassi	lications												
DE Class DE Code Description Group II: Ten (10) Cons	12/11 Loss Cost truction C	DE Rates as		MD 1/12 Class Loss Code Cost		ige of s of 1/1/12 High	NJ Class Code	Approved NJ Rates 1/1/12	PA 4 Class L Code 0	oss		nge of s of 4/1/12 High	VA Class Code	4/12 Loss Cost	Rar VA Rates as Low	nge of s of 4/1/12 High	WV Class Code	Approved WV 11/11 Loss Costs		ge of s of 11/1/11 High
601 Road Construction	8.80	7.90	20.86	5506 7.38 9019 1.87		18.71 4.74	5500 5610 6042	9.71 7.43 7.49	601 6	6.63	5.97	16.97	5506 9019	6.12 1.53	6.12 1.53	14.48 3.62	5506 9019		4.13 1.07	10.97 2.84
608 Flat Cement Work	5.16	4.63	12.23	5215 4.32 5221 3.56 6204 10.22	3.17	10.95 9.02 25.91	5200 5215	11.18 13.70	608 5	5.86	5.27	15.00	5215 5221 6204	2.81 2.99 9.57	2.81 2.99 9.57	6.65 7.07 22.64	5215 5221 6204	3.03	2.34 2.22 6.56	6.20 5.89 17.41
609 Excavation	4.57	4.10	10.83	5703 15.70 6018 2.62 6045 2.43 6217 5.07 6229 5.00 6233 4.89	2.33 2.17 4.52 4.46	39.80 6.64 6.16 12.85 12.68 12.40	1605 5703 6005 6039 6217 6233	9.96 20.49 13.95 10.5 9.96 7.76	609 4	4.79	4.31	12.26	1605 5703 6018 6045 6217 6229 6233	7.23 11.16 3.44 1.45 4.23 3.07 5.14	7.23 11.16 3.44 1.45 4.23 3.07 5.14	17.11 26.40 8.14 3.43 10.01 7.26 12.16	5703 6018 6217 6229 6233	2.34 4.56 3.99	12.56 1.72 3.34 2.92 2.87	33.32 4.55 8.87 7.76 7.60
651 Carpentry	5.78	5.19	13.70	5102 6.34 5402 3.09 5403 6.98	2.75	16.07 7.83 17.69	5103 5402 5403 5701	11.88 19.09 16.94 16.81	651 6	6.48	5.83	16.58	5102 5402 5403	3.92 2.32 5.02	3.92 2.32 5.02	9.27 5.49 11.88	5102	4.32	3.17	8.40
652 Carpentry - Detached Dwellings	7.41	6.65	17.56	5102 6.34 5645 7.69 5651 7.69	6.85	16.07 19.49 19.49	5103 5645	11.88 16.94	652 8	3.30	7.47	21.24	5102 5645 5651	3.92 8.05 6.08	3.92 8.05 6.08	9.27 19.05 14.39	5102 5645 5651	10.33	3.17 7.57 5.51	8.40 20.09 14.63
653 Masonry	6.89	6.19	16.33	5022 6.26	5.58	15.87	5022 5458 5459 5701	17.16 18.96 18.96 16.81	653 6	6.95	6.26	17.79	5022	4.14	4.14	9.80	5022	5.08	3.72	9.88
661 Electrical Wiring - Within Buildings	2.60	2.33	6.16	5190 3.64	3.24	9.23	5190	4.86	661 3	3.19	2.87	8.16	5190	2.43	2.43	5.75	5190	3.04	2.23	5.91
663 Plumbing	3.96	3.56	9.39	5183 4.35 5188 4.87		11.03 12.35	5183 5184 5188	6.66 4.72 5.38	663 4	4.04	3.64	10.34	5183 5188	2.72 2.85	2.72 2.85	6.44 6.74	5183 5188		2.21 2.37	5.87 6.28
664 Heating or Ventilating	3.76	3.38	8.91	5537 4.56	4.06	11.56	3724 5183 5190 5538	8.51 6.66 4.86 6.81	664 3	3.76	3.38	9.62	3724 5183 5190	4.05 2.72 2.43	4.05 2.72 2.43	9.58 6.44 5.75	5537	3.96	2.90	7.70
675 Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair	3.65	3.28	8.65	3724 4.61 5160 3.29 9534 9.57		11.69 8.34 24.26	3724 5160	8.51 5.90	675 3	3.82	3.44	9.78	3724 5160 9534	4.05 3.06 3.17	4.05 3.06 3.17	9.58 7.24 7.50	3724 5160 9534	3.46	2.95 2.54 3.43	7.82 6.73 9.10

Delaware Compensation Rating Bureau, Inc.

Rating Value Comparison - 30 Selected Delaware Classifications

DE 12/11 Range of MD 1/12 Range of NJ Approved PA 4/12 Range of VΑ 4/12 Range of W۷ Approved Range of Class DE Loss DE Rates as of 12/1/11 Class Loss MD Rates as of 1/1/12 Class NJ Rates Class Loss PA Rates as of 4/1/12 Class Loss VA Rates as of 4/1/12 Class WV 11/11 WV Rates as of 11/1/11 High 1/1/12 High Code Description Cost Low High Code Cost Low Code Code Cost Low High Code Cost Low High Code Loss Costs Low Group III: Ten (10) "Other" Classifications 811 Trucking 6.65 5.97 15.76 7222 5.48 4.88 13.89 7196 10.47 811 7.26 6.53 18.58 7222 4.99 4.99 11.81 7228 4.94 3.62 9.61 7228 5.93 5.28 15.03 7219 14.08 7228 4.84 4.84 11.45 7229 5.58 4.09 10.85 7229 7.01 6.25 17.77 7231 9.91 7229 6.57 6.57 15.54 7230 3.88 2.84 7.55 7230 4.94 7360 7230 5.74 9534 3.43 5.54 14.04 12.11 5.74 13.58 4.68 9.10 9534 9.57 8.53 24.26 7250 16.91 9534 3.17 3.17 7.50 9530 8.13 818 Automobile Dealer 1.38 1.24 3.27 8002 1.66 1.48 4.21 7369 4.22 818 1.30 1.17 3.33 8002 1.45 1.45 3.43 8002 1.64 1.20 3.19 8380 2.30 2.05 5.83 8398 5.00 8380 2.00 2.00 4.73 8380 2.19 1.61 4.26 8385 2.51 2.24 6.36 8748 0.99 8385 1.79 1.79 4.24 8385 2.64 1.94 5.13 865 Poultry, Fish Dealers 1.69 1.52 4.01 2095 2.52 2.25 6.39 2089 8.28 865 3.29 2.96 8.42 2095 2.67 2.67 6.32 2095 2.39 1.75 4.65 Processors 2114 1.85 1.65 4.69 2095 8.28 2114 1.15 1.15 2.72 8021 1.95 1.43 3.79 8021 3.04 2.71 7.71 2114 6.08 8021 1.84 1.84 4.35 8021 7.79 928 Retail Store, NOC 2.10 1.89 4.98 4360 0.87 0.78 2.21 4360 2.18 928 2.31 2.08 5.91 4360 0.89 0.89 2.11 4361 1.18 0.86 2.30 4361 1.03 0.92 2.61 4361 2.18 4361 1.28 1.28 3.03 8017 1.22 0.89 2.37 3.57 8017 1.50 1.34 8017 8017 1.09 1.09 0.69 3.80 2.58 8072 0.51 1.34 8072 0.59 0.45 0.53 8072 1.09 2.58 8831 1.04 0.76 2.02 1.50 8831 0.95 0.85 2.41 8831 1.25 0.45 1.06 1.25 2.96 951 Outside Salesmen 0.36 0.32 0.85 8720 1.29 1.15 8720 3.03 951 0.42 0.38 1.07 8720 0.82 0.82 8720 1.24 0.91 2.41 3.27 1.94 8721 0.17 0.15 0.43 8742 0.52 8721 0.14 0.14 0.33 8721 0.27 0.20 0.53 8742 0.29 0.26 0.74 8803 0.24 8742 0.22 0.22 0.52 8742 0.36 0.26 0.70 8803 0.07 0.06 0.18 8803 0.04 0.04 0.09 8803 0.07 0.05 0.14 9012 0.69 0.61 1.75 9012 0.84 0.84 1.99 9012 1.00 0.73 1.95 8810 0.10 953 Clerical Office 0.19 0.17 0.45 8810 0.14 0.12 0.24 953 0.19 0.17 0.49 0.10 8810 0.21 0.15 0.41 0.35 8810 0.24 8871 0.12 0.11 0.30 8871 0.14 0.14 8871 0.19 0.14 0.37 0.33 0.42 8832 0.24 8832 0.36 0.23 8832 957 Physicians or Dentists 0.47 0.21 0.61 0.54 957 0.40 1.02 8832 0.23 0.54 0.25 0.18 0.49 1.11 960 Nursing Home 3.39 3.04 8.03 8829 1.85 1.65 4.69 8829 4.39 960 2.88 2.59 7.37 8829 1.83 1.83 4.33 8829 2.57 1.88 5.00 2.34 971 Building Operation 3.37 3.03 7.99 0917 4.86 4.33 12.32 0917 9.11 971 3.58 3.22 9.16 0917 2.73 2.73 6.46 0917 3.19 6.20 2.02 1.50 3.97 9014 2.27 5.75 9014 6.16 9014 1.64 1.64 3.88 9014 2.04 9015 2.19 4.40 1.95 5.55 9015 6.68 9015 2.09 2.09 4.94 9015 2.26 1.66 9170 3.58 3.19 9.08 9023 1.16 1.16 2.74 9170 2.34 1.72 4.55 9170 1.99 1.99 4.71 975 Restaurants 1.61 1.45 3.82 9082 1.21 1.08 3.07 9078 7.25 975 1.58 1.42 4.04 9082 1.18 1.18 2.79 9082 1.15 0.84 2.24 9079 3.33

Exhibit 1

#### DELAWARE COMPENSATION RATING BUREAU., INC.

#### Classification Descriptions for States Other than Delaware Used in Rate Comparison

The following listing presents brief descriptions of classification definitions from states other than Delaware used in the DCRB's rate comparison study. For detailed definitions, refer to each state's classification manual and related rules.

#### **SECTION 1: MANUFACTURING CLASSIFICATION CODES**

#### **MARYLAND**

Delaware	Maryland	Maryland
Classification	Classification	Description of
Code	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>
104	4747	Dutter Cubetitute Mfr
104	4717	Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4825	Flavorings, Licorice or Medicinal Extract
		Mfg. Rated as Drug, Medicine or Pharmaceutical Mfg.
	6504	Food Sundries Mfg., N.O.C.
	8102	Peanut Handling Rated as Seed
	0102	Merchant
112	2157	Bottling NOC & Route
		Supervisors, Drivers
222	4431	Phonograph Mfg.
	4452	Plastic Extruded Products Mfg., Rated as
		Plastics Mfg of Sheets, Rods, Tubes,
		etc.
	4459	Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4470	Cable Mfg., Insulated Electrical
	4484	Plastics Mfg., Molded Products, N.O.C.
227	4493	Oilcloth or Linoleum Mfg Rated as
		Fabric Coating or Impregnating, N.O.C.
406	3018	Iron or Steel: Rolling Mill & Drivers
	3241	Wire Drawing - Iron or Steel
411	3030	Iron or Steel Works - Shop - Structural &
		Drivers
413	3040	Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works -
	2042	Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
454	3042	Elevator or Escalator Mfg.
454	3064	Sign Mfg Metal Or Neon - Shop Only
	3069	Sheet Metal Products Mfg.
	3169	Stove Mfg.
	3220	Can Mfg.
	3224	Enamel Ware Mfg.
	3227	Aluminum Ware Mfg.
	3400	Metal Stamped Goods, Mfg., N.O.C.
	3803	Automobile Wheel Mfg Metal - Not Cast
	3807	Automobile Radiator Mfg.

## Section 1 MARYLAND (continued)

Delaware	Maryland	Maryland
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>
581	2305	Textile Mfg Synthetic
	4459	Plastic Materials Mfg Rated as Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4557	Lubricants Mfg Grease/Oil Mixing Rated as Ink Mfg.
	4740	Oil Refining, Petroleum
	4741	Asphalt or Tar Distilling or Refining
	4751	Synthetic Rubber Mfg.
759	6325	Main Coaxial Cable - Underground Only. Cable laid with automatic equipment - Rated as Conduit Construction
	7600	Cable Television - Extension, Line Maintenance & Service Connections (house connections only) - Rated as
	7601	Telephone or Telegraph Company - all other employees Cable Television - Stringing of Cable on Existing Utility Poles rated as Telephone or Telegraph Company

#### **NEW JERSEY**

Delaware Classification <u>Code</u>	New Jersey Classification <u>Code</u>		New Jersey Description of <u>Business</u>
104	2150 4627		Ice Mfg. Extract Mfg Dyewood Licorice or Tanning
	4628		Extract Mfg Perfumery, medicinal or flavoring
	6504		Food Sundries Mfg., N.O.C.
	8102		Peanut Handling Rated as Seed Merchant
112	2156		Bottling - No Carbinated Liquids or spiritous liquors - Route Supervisors, Drivers. NPD
	2157		Bottling NOC & Route Supervisors, Drivers
222	4431		Magnetic or Optical Recording Media Mfg.
	4452		Plastics Mfg: Fabricated Products N.O.C.
	4459		Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4470		Cable Mfg., Insulated Electrical
	4484		Plastics Mfg., Molded Products , N.O.C.
227	4491		Linoleum Mfg Burlap or Felt
	4493		Fabric Coating or Impregnating, N.O.C.
406	3018		Iron or Steel: Rolling Mill & Drivers
	3241		Wire Drawing - Iron or Steel
411			Pipe or Tube Mfg Iron or Steel - not cast
	3028	+	iron - & Drivers
	3030		Iron or Steel Works - Shop - Structural & Drivers
	3040	+	Iron or Steel: Iron Works - Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
	3041	+	Iron or Steel: Iron Works - Shop - Decorative or Artistic & Foundries & Drivers

## Section 1 NEW JERSEY (continued)

Delaware	New Jersey		New Jersey
Classification	Classification		Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>		<u>Business</u>
413	3030	+	Iron or Steel Works - Shop - Structural & Drivers
	3040		Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works - Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
	3042		Elevator or Escalator Mfg.
454	3045		Steel Barrel Or Drum Mfg.
	3066		Sheet Metal Work - Shop
	3075		Coppersmith - Shop
	3076		Fireproof Equipment Mfg.
	3169		Stove Mfg.
	3220		Can Mfg.
	3227		Aluminum Ware Mfg.
	3400		Metal Goods Mfg., N.O.C., also Metal Stamping - Shop
	3807		Automobile Radiator Mfg. NPD
581	2420		Textile Piece Goods Finishing NOC & Drivers
	4459		Plastic Materials Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4712		Grease or Oil Mixing or Blending
	4740		Oil Refining - Petroleum & Drivers
	4741		Asphalt or Tar Distilling or Refining & Drivers
	4829		Chemical Mfg., N.O.C.
759	6325		Conduit Construction - For Cables or Wire & Drivers
	7600		Telephone or Telegraph Company & Drivers
	7601		Telephone, Telegraph or Fire Alarm Construction & Drivers

#### **PENNSYLVANIA**

As of January 1, 2012 each of the Delaware manufacturing classifications studied correspond to or fall entirely within the same numerical classification in Pennsylvania.

#### **VIRGINIA**

Delaware	Virginia	Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>
104	2055	Peanut Handling
	4717	Butter Substitute Mfg.
	4825	Extract Mfg. (Flavoring, Licorice, Perfumery or Medicinal) Rated as Drug, Medicine or Pharmaceutical Mfg.
	6504	Food Sundries Mfg.

#### Section 1 VIRGINIA (continued)

Delaware	Virginia	Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>
112	2157	Bottling NOC & Route Supervisors, Drivers
222	4431	Phonograph Mfg.
	4452	Plastic Extruded Products Mfg., Rated as Plastics - Mfg. of Sheets, Rods, Tubes, etc.
	4459	Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4470	Cable Mfg., Insulated Electrical
	4484	Plastics Mfg., Molded Products, N.O.C.
227	4493	Oilcloth or Linoleum Mfg Rated as Fabric Coating or Impregnating
406	3018	Iron or Steel: Rolling Mill & Drivers
	3241	Wire Drawing - Iron or Steel
411	3030	Iron or Steel Works - Shop - Structural & Drivers
413	3040	Iron or Steel Fabrication - Iron Works - Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
	3042	Elevator or Escalator Mfg.
454	3064	Sign Mfg Metal Or Neon - Shop Only
	3076	Fireproof Equipment Mfg.
	3169	Stove Mfg.
	3220	Can Mfg.
	3224	Enamel Ware Mfg.
	3227	Aluminum Ware Mfg.
	3400	Metal Stamped Goods, Mfg., N.O.C.
	3803	Automobile Wheel Mfg Metal - Not Cast
	3807	Automobile Radiator Mfg.
581	2305	Textile Fiber Mfg Synthetic
	4459	Plastic Materials Mfg., Rated as Plastics Mfg., Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4557	Lubricants Mfg Grease/Oil Mixing - Rated as Ink Mfg.
	4740	Oil Refining - Petroleum
	4741	Asphalt or Tar Distilling or Refining
	4751	Synthetic Rubber Mfg.
		Main Coaxial Cable - Underground Only. Cable laid with automatic equipment -
759	6325	Rated as Conduit Construction Cable Television - Extension, Line Maintenance & Service Connections (house connections only) - Rated as Telephone or Telegraph Company - all
	7600	other employees
	7601	Cable Television - Stringing of Cable on Existing Utility Poles rated as Telephone or Telegraph Company

#### Section 1 WEST VIRGINIA

Delaware	West Virginia	West Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>
104	4825	Drug, Medicine or Pharmaceutical Preparation Mfg Includes Mfg. of
		Ingredients
	6504	Food and Sundries Mfg. , N.O.C.
	8102	Seed Merchant
112	2157	Bottling NOC & Route Supervisors, Drivers
222	4452	Plastics Mfg - Fabricated Products N.O.C.
	4459	Plastics Mfg. Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4484	Molding and Fabricated Plastic Products Mfg., N.O.C.
227	4493	Fabric Coating or Impregnating N.O.C.
406	3018	Iron or Steel: Manufacturing: Rolling Mill & Drivers
411	3030	Iron or Steel Works - Shop - Structural & Drivers
413	3040	Iron or Steel: Fabrication: Iron Works - Shop - Ornamental & Drivers
454	3064	Sign Manufacturing Metal
	3069	Awning Mfg - Metal
	3169	Stove Mfg.
	3220	Can Mfg.
	3224	Coating of Metal Ware , N.O.C.
	3227	Aluminum Ware Mfg.
	3400	Metal Goods Mfg., N.O.C.
	3807	Automobile Radiator Mfg.
581	2305	Synthetic Fiber Mfg Rated as Manufacturing - Textiles
	4459	Plastics Mfg Sheets, Rods or Tubes
	4557	Ink Mfg.
	4740	Oil Refining
	4741	Asphalt or Tar Distilling or Refining & Drivers
759	6325	Main Coaxial Cable - Underground Only. Cable laid with automatic equipment -
	7600	Rated as Conduit Construction Cable Television - Extension, Line Maintenance & Service Connections (house connections only) - Rated as Telephone or Telegraph Company - all
	7601	other employees Cable Television - Stringing of Cable on Existing Utility Poles rated as Telephone or Telegraph Company

#### SECTION 2: CONTRACTING CLASSIFICATION CODES

#### MARYLAND

Delaware	Maryland	Maryland
Classification	Classification	Description of
Code	Code	Business
601	5506	Street or Road Construction, Paving or Repaving
	9019	Bridge or Vehicular Tunnel Operation
608	5215	Concrete Work - Incidental to Construction of Private Residences
	5221	Concrete or Cement Work - Floors, Driveways, Yards or Sidewalks
	6204	Drilling, N.O.C.
609	5703	Building Moving or Raising
	6018	Dam or Lock Construction: Earth Moving or Placing - All Operations
	6045	Levee Construction - All Operations to Completion
	6217	Excavation
	6229	Irrigation or Drainage System Construction
	6233	Oil or Gas Pipeline Construction
651	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5402	Hothouse Erection - All Operations
	5403	Carpentry, N.O.C.
652	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5645	Carpentry - Detached One or Two Family Dwellings
	5651	Carpentry - Dwellings - Three Stories or Less
653	5022	Masonry, N.O.C.
661	5190	Electrical Wiring Within Buildings
663	5183	Plumbing, N.O.C.
	5188	Automatic Sprinkler Installation
664	5537	Heating, Ventilation, Air-Conditioning And
		Refrigerations Systems - Insallation, Service and Repair, Shop, Yard & Drivers
675	3724	Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair
	5160	Elevator Erection or Repair
	9534	Mobile Crane & Hoisting Service

#### Section 2 NEW JERSEY

Delaware	New Jersey	New Jersey
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>
601	5500	Street or Road Paving, Surfacing or Resurfacing & Drivers
	5610	Cleaner - Debris Removal - Construction
	6042	Street or Road Construction & Drivers
	7720	Bridge or Vehicular Tunnel Operation
608	5200	Cement Work - Sidewalks, Cellar Floors,
		Driveways including Drivers
	5215	Concrete Work - Incidental to Construction of Private Residences
609	1605	Excavation - Rock & Drivers
	5703	Building Underpinning - Rated as Building Moving or Raising
	6005	Jetty or Breakwater Construction & Drivers
	6039	Grading of Land , N.O.C. & Drivers
	6217	Excavation NOC & Drivers
	6233	Oil or Gas Pipeline Construction & Drivers
651	5103	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection or Repair - Metal or Metal Covered & Drivers
	5402	Hothouse Erection - All Operations
	5403	Carpentry, N.O.C. & Drivers
	5701	Wrecking: Buildings or Structures
652	5103	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection or Repair - Metal or Metal Covered
	5645	Carpentry - Detached One or Two Family Dwellings & Drivers
653	5022	Masonry, N.O.C.
	5458	Cleaning or Renovating Building Exteriors - No Sandblasting or Use of Siliceous
	5459	Materials & Drivers Cleaning or Renovating Building Exteriors
	5701	- , N.O.C. & Drivers Wrecking: Buildings or Structures - Not
661	E400	Marine
661	5190	Electrical Wiring Within Buildings & Drivers
663	5183	Plumbing, N.O.C. & Drivers
	5184	Steam Pipe or Boiler Insulating & Shop, Drivers
	5188	Automatic Sprinkler Installation & Drivers
664	3724	Millwright Work, N.O.C. & Drivers
001	0724	Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair NOC & Drivers
	5183	Plumbing, N.O.C.
	5190	Electrical Wiring - Within Buildings
	5538	Sheet Metal Work - Shop and Outside &
	0000	Drivers NOC
675	3724	Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair
	5160	Elevator Erection or Repair

#### Section 2 PENNSYLVANIA

As of January 1, 2012 each of the Delaware contracting classifications studied correspond to or fall entirely within the same numerical classification in Pennsylvania.

#### VIRGINIA

Delaware	Virginia	Virginia
Classification	Classification	Description of
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>
601	5506	Street or Road Construction, Paving or Repaving
	9019	Bridge or Vehicular Tunnel Operation
608	5215	Concrete Work - Incidental to Construction of Private Residences
	5221	Concrete or Cement Work - Floors, Driveways, Yards or Sidewalks
	6204	Drilling, N.O.C.
609	1605	Excavation - Rock
	5703	Building Moving or Raising
	6018	Dam or Lock Construction: Earth Moving or Placing - All Operations
	6045	Levee Construction - All Operations to Completion
	6217	Excavation
	6229	Irrigation or Drainage System Construction
	6233	Oil or Gas Pipeline Construction
651	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5402	Hothouse Erection - All Operations
	5403	Carpentry, N.O.C.
652	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection - Metal or Metal Covered
	5645	Carpentry - Detached One or Two Family Dwellings
	5651	Carpentry - Dwellings - Three Stories or Less
653	5022	Masonry, N.O.C.
661	5190	Electrical Wiring Within Buildings
663	5183	Plumbing, N.O.C.
	5188	Automatic Sprinkler Installation
664	3724	Machinery Or Equipment Erection Or Repair , N.O.C for the installation of non- portable air conditioning systems
	5183	Plumbing - for the installation or service of residential heating units
	5190	Electrical Wiring - Within Buildings - for the cleaning, oiling or adjusting of non-portable air conditioning systems
675	3724	Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair
	5160	Elevator Erection or Repair
	9534	Mobile Crane & Hoisting Service

#### Section 2 WEST VIRGINIA

Delaware Classification	West Virginia Classification	West Virginia Description of Business						
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	DUSITIESS						
601	5506	Street and Road Construction						
	9019	Bridge or Vehicular Tunnel Operation						
608	5215	Cellar, Concrete Floor, Sidewalk,						
		Driveway and Foundation Construction						
	5221	Concrete or Cement Work - Floors,						
	0004	Driveways, Yards or Sidewalks & Drivers						
	6204	Drilling N.O.C. & Drivers						
609	5703	Building Moving Rated as Building						
	6019	Razing, Moving or Demolition						
	6018	Dam or Lock Construction: Earth Moving or Placing - All Operations & Drivers						
	6217	Excavation, N.O.C.						
	6229	Irrigation or Drainage System						
	0220	Construction & Drivers						
	6233	Oil or Gas Pipeline Construction						
651	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection -						
		Metal or Metal Covered						
652	5102	Door, Door Frame or Sash Erection -						
		Metal or Metal Covered						
	5645	Carpentry - Detached One or Two Family						
	5054	Dwelling						
	5651	Carpentry - Dwellings - Three Stories or Less						
653	5022	Masonry, N.O.C.						
655	3719	Oil Still Erection Or Repair						
	5037	Painting - Metal Structures - Over Two						
	333.	Stories In Height						
	5040	Iron Or Steel Erection - Frame Structures						
	5057	Iron Or Steel Erection N.O.C.						
	5069	Iron Or Steel Erection - Dwellings not						
	F222	Exceeding Two Stories Concrete Construction In Connection						
	5222	With Bridges Or Culverts						
661	5190	Electrical Wiring Within Buildings						
663	5183	Plumbing and Pipefitting , N.O.C.						
000	5188	Automatic Sprinkler Installation & Drivers						
664	5537	Heating, Ventilation, Air-Conditioning and						
	333.	Refrigeration Systems - Installation,						
		Service and Repair & Drivers						
675	3724	Millwright Work						
	5160	Elevator Erection or Repair						
	9534	Mobile Crane and Hoisting Service						
		Contractors - N.O.C All Operations &						
		Drivers						

#### **SECTION 3: OTHER INDUSTRIES CLASSIFICATION CODES**

#### MARYLAND

Delaware	Maryland	Maryland						
Classification	Classification	Description of						
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>						
811	7222	Trucking, Oil Field Equipment All Employees & Drivers						
	7228	Trucking, Local Hauling						
	7229	Trucking - Long Distance Hauling						
	7230	Trucking - Parcel or Package Delivery						
	9534	Mobile Crane and Hoisting Service Contractor , N.O.C All Operations (Including Yard)						
818	8002	Auto Rental Co - All Other Employees						
	8380	Auto Sales or Service Agency						
	8385	Auto Rental Garage Employees						
865	2095	Meat Products Mfg., N.O.C.						
	2114	Oyster Processing						
	8021	Fish, Meat Or Poultry Dealer - Wholesale						
928	4360	Motion Picture - Development of Negatives, Printing and All Subsequent Operations						
	4361	Photographer						
	8017	Store: Retail, N.O.C.						
	8072	Store: Book, Record, Compact Disk, Software, Video or Audio Cassette - Retail						
	8831	Pet Grooming - Rated as Hospital - Veterinary						
951	8720	Inspection of Risks for Insurance or Valuation Purposes						
	8721	Real Estate Appraisal Company - Outside Employees						
	8742	Salespersons, Collectors or Messengers						
	8803	Auditors, Accountants or Factory Cost or Office Systematizer						
	9012	Building Operation by Owner, Lessee or Real Estate Management Firm: Professional Employees, Property						
		Managers & Leasing Agents including Clerical Office & Sales						
953	8810	Clerical Office Employees, N.O.C.						
	8871	Clerical Telecommuter Employees						
957	8832	Physician & Clerical						
960 **	8829	Convalescent or Nursing Home - All						
		Employees						
971	0917	Domestic Service Contractor - Inside						
	9014	Buildings - Operation by Contractor						
	9015	Buildings - Operation by Owner						
		Janitorial Services by Contractors -						
	0470	Includes Window Cleaning Above Ground						
075 **	9170	Level & Drivers						
975 **	9082	Restaurant, N.O.C.						

#### Section 3

#### **NEW JERSEY**

Delaware Classification	New Jersey Classification	New Jersey Description of					
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>					
811	7196	Truckmen - Hauling Liquid or Liquefied Products in Tank Trucks & Drivers					
	7219	Trucking, N.O.C. & Drivers					
	7231	+ Courier or Messenger Service Company & Drivers					
	7250	Truckmen - Hauling of Explosives or Ammunition & Drivers					
	7360	Freight Handeling NOC					
	9530	Mobile Crane and Hoisting Service, N.O.C. & Drivers					
818	7369	Auto or Truck Rental or Leasing or Livery Co.					
	8398	Automobile Sales or Service Agency & Parts, Service Dept. Employees & Drivers					
	8748	Automobile Salespersons					
865	2089	Packing House - Meat					
	2095	Meat Products Mfg., N.O.C.					
	2114	Oystermen					
	8021	Fish, Meat Or Poultry Dealer - Wholesale					
928	4360	Photographer - All Employees & Clerical, Salesman, Drivers					
	4361	Photographer					
	8017	Store: Retail , N.O.C.					
951	8720	Inspection of Risks for Insurance or Valuation Purposes NOC					
	8742	Salespersons - Outside					
	8803	Auditor or Factory Cost or Office Systematizer - Traveling					
953	8810	Clerical Office Employees, N.O.C.					
957	8832	Physician & Clerical					
960 **	8829 *	Convalescent or Nursing Home including Drivers					
971	0917	Domestic Service Contractor - Inside Buildings - Operation by Contractors &					
	9014	Drivers Building NOC - Operation by Owner or					
	9015	Lessee					
975 **	9078	Commisary Work					
	9079	Restaurant					

#### **PENNSYLVANIA**

As of January 1, 2012 each of the Delaware other industries classifications studied correspond to or fall entirely within the same numerical classification in Pennsylvania.

### **VIRGINIA**

Delaware	Virginia	Virginia					
Classification	Classification	Description of					
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	<u>Business</u>					
811	7222	Trucking, Oil Field Equipment, All Employees & Drivers					
	7228	Trucking, Local Hauling					
	7229	Trucking, Long Distance Hauling					
	7230	Trucking - Parcel or Package Delivery					
	9534	Mobile Crane and Hoisting Service Contractor , N.O.C All Operations (Including Yard)					
818	8002	Auto Rental Co - All Other Employees					
	8380	Auto Sales or Service Agency					
	8385	Auto Rental Garage Employees					
865	2095	Meat Products Mfg., N.O.C.					
	2114	Oyster Processing					
	8021	Fish, Meat Or Poultry Dealer - Wholesale					
928	4360	Motion Picture Development of Negatives, Printing and All Subsequent					
	4361	Operations Photographer					
	8017	Store: Retail , N.O.C.					
	8072	Store: Book, Record, Compact Disc,					
	0072	Software, Video or Audio Cassette Store- Retail					
	8831	Pet Grooming - Rated as Hospital -					
		Veterinary					
951	8720	Inspection of Risks for Insurance or Valuation Purposes					
	8721	Real Estate Appraisal Company - Outside Employees					
	8742	Salespersons, Collectors or Messengers					
	8803	Auditors, Accountants or Factory Cost or Office Systematizer					
	9012	Building Operation by Owner, Lessee or Real Estate Management Firm: Professional Employees, Property Managers & Leasing Agents including					
		Clerical Office & Sales					
953	8810	Office , N.O.C.					
	8871	Clerical Telecommuter Employees					
957	8832	Physician & Clerical					
960 **	8829	Convalescent or Nursing Home - All Employees					
975 **	9082	Restaurant, N.O.C.					
971	0917	Domestic Service Contractor - Inside					
	9014	<b>Buildings - Operation by Contractor</b>					
	9015	Buildings - Operation by Owner					
	9023	Buildings - Residential - Operation by Owner or Lessee					
	9170	Janitorial Services by Contractors - Includes Window Cleaning Above Ground Level & Drivers					
975	9082	Restaurant N.O.C.					

#### Section 3 WEST VIRGINIA

Delaware Classification	West Virginia Classification	West Virginia Description of						
<u>Code</u>	<u>Code</u>	Business						
<u></u>	<u></u>	<u> </u>						
811	7228	Trucking Local Hauling Only - All Employees & Drivers						
	7229	Trucking Long Distance Hauling Only - All Employees & Drivers						
	7230	Trucking Parcel or Package Delivery - All Employees & Drivers						
	9534	Mobile Crane and Hoisting Service Contractors - NOC - all Operations and Drivers Automobile Rental Co.: All Other						
		Employees & Counter Personnel &						
818	8002	Drivers						
	8380	Automobile Service or Repair Center & Dri						
	8385	Automobile/Truck Equipment Rental						
		Operations						
865	2095	Meat Products Mfg N.O.C.						
	8021	Store: Meat, Fish or Poultry Dealer - Wholesale						
928	4361	Photographers						
	8017	Retail Stores, N.O.C.						
	8072	Store: Book, Record, Compact Disk, Software, Video or Audio Cassette Retail						
	8831	Dog Salons - Rated as Veterinarian Hospital						
951	8720	Inspection of Risks for Insurance or Valuation Purposes N.O.C.						
	8721	Real Estate Appraisal Company - Outside Employees						
	8742	Salespersons (includes Inspectors)						
	8803	Accountants, Auditors						
	9012	Buildings - Operation by Owner, Lessee or Real Estate Management Firm						
953	8810	Clerical Employees, N.O.C.						
	8871	Clerical Telecommuter Employees						
957	8832	Physician & Clerical						
960**	8829	Nursing Homes						
971	0917	Residential Cleaning Services by						
	0044	Contractor - Inside						
	9014	Building Maintenance						
	9015	Buildings - Operation by Owner, Lessee or Real Estate Management Firm						
	9170	Buildings - Operation by Contractors - Includes window cleaning above one story						
975 **	9082	Restaurant N.O.C.						

#### NOTES:

"N.O.C."	Not otherwise classified in state manual
14.0.0.	Tion of the mise classified in state manda

Designates classification which includes all employees including office
 Designates classification which includes all employees EXCEPT office

+ Included per recommendation of states rating agency.

Exhibit 3

Summary Rate Comparison for Selected Largest Delaware Classifications

DE	DE Rates Effective 12/1/11		MD Rates Effective 1/1/12		NJ Rates Effective 1/1/12		PA Rates Effective 4/1/12		VA Rates Effective 4/1/12		WV Rates Effective 11/1/11	
Code Description	Low	High	Low	High	Low	High	Low	High	Low	High	Low	High
Group I: Manufacturing Classifications												
104 Food Sundries Mfg., NOC	\$2.88	\$7.61	\$0.65	\$7.43	\$1.99	\$10.86	\$2.73	\$7.75	\$0.82	\$4.71	\$0.48	\$3.54
112 Beverage Mfg.	7.22	19.05	4.76	13.54	9.37	20.53	8.99	25.56	4.00	9.46	3.43	9.10
222 Plastic Articles Mfg, NOC	3.25	8.58	1.28	9.28	5.30	9.99	2.54	7.22	1.11	5.87	1.41	4.20
227 Oilcloth, Linoleum &	2.41	6.35	1.57	4.46	4.15	9.06	3.50	9.95	1.83	4.33	1.55	4.12
406 Rolling Mill - Ferrous	3.85	10.17	2.21	8.31	6.94	10.06	4.37	12.41	2.03	8.42	1.68	4.45
411 Steel Fabricating	7.30	19.27	5.91	16.81	4.26	16.66	4.55	12.95	7.06	16.70	3.63	9.63
413 Iron Works	5.19	13.70	4.22	15.26	9.97	16.66	4.76	13.54	2.96	11.24	3.30	8.75
454 Sheet Metal Products	4.73	12.49	1.79	9.28	3.40	11.10	2.89	8.21	1.87	7.29	1.25	9.37
581 Oil Refining	1.54	4.08	1.15	9.28	1.10	13.13	1.92	5.45	1.18	4.31	0.97	4.24
759 Cable Television Operators	2.76	7.28	2.17	15.95	5.75	6.84	4.50	12.80	1.93	9.89	1.72	9.22
Group I Average *	\$3.01	\$7.95	\$1.76	\$9.41	\$3.91	\$11.51	\$3.16	\$8.99	\$1.72	\$6.34	\$1.45	\$5.38
Group II: Contracting Classifications												
601 Road Construction	7.90	20.86	1.67	18.71	7.43	9.71	5.97	16.97	1.53	14.48	1.07	10.97
608 Flat Cement Work	4.63	12.23	3.17	25.91	11.18	13.70	5.27	15.00	2.81	22.64	2.22	17.41
609 Excavation	4.10	10.83	2.17	39.80	7.76	20.49	4.31	12.26	1.45	26.40	1.72	33.32
651 Carpentry	5.19	13.70	2.75	17.69	11.88	19.09	5.83	16.58	2.32	11.88	3.17	8.40
652 Carpentry - Detached  Dwellings	6.65	17.56	5.65	19.49	11.88	16.94	7.47	21.24	3.92	19.05	3.17	20.09
653 Masonry	6.19	16.33	5.58	15.87	16.81	18.96	6.26	17.79	4.14	9.80	3.72	9.88
661 Electrical Wiring -	2.33	6.16	3.24	9.23	4.86	4.86	2.87	8.16	2.43	5.75	2.23	5.91
663 Plumbing	3.56	9.39	3.88	12.35	4.72	6.66	3.64	10.34	2.72	6.74	2.21	6.28
664 Heating or Ventilating	3.38	8.91	4.06	11.56	4.86	8.51	3.38	9.62	2.43	9.58	2.90	7.70
675 Machinery or Equipment Erection or Repair	3.28	8.65	2.93	24.26	5.90	8.51	3.44	9.78	3.06	9.58	2.54	9.10
Group II Average *	\$4.18	\$11.03	\$3.67	\$18.47	\$7.59	\$11.30	\$4.42	\$12.58	\$2.73	\$12.49	\$2.54	\$12.09
Group III: "Other" Classifications												
811 Trucking	5.97	15.76	4.88	24.26	8.13	16.91	6.53	18.58	3.17	15.54	2.84	10.85
818 Automobile Dealer	1.24	3.27	1.48	6.36	0.99	5.00	1.17	3.33	1.45	4.73	1.20	5.13
865 Poultry, Fish Dealers	1.52	4.01	1.65	7.71	6.08	8.28	2.96	8.42	1.15	6.32	1.43	4.65
928 Retail Store, NOC	1.89	4.98	0.53	3.80	2.18	3.57	2.08	5.91	0.45	3.03	0.51	2.37
951 Outside Salesmen	0.32	0.85	0.06	3.27	0.24	3.03	0.38	1.07	0.04	1.99	0.05	2.41
953 Clerical Office	0.17	0.45	0.11	0.35	0.24	0.24	0.17	0.49	0.10	0.33	0.14	0.41
957 Physicians or Dentists	0.42	1.11	0.21	0.61	0.54	0.54	0.36	1.02	0.23	0.54	0.18	0.49
960 Nursing Home	3.04	8.03	1.65	4.69	4.39	4.39	2.59	7.37	1.83	4.33	1.88	5.00
971 Building Operation	3.03	7.99	1.95	12.32	6.16	9.11	3.22	9.16	1.16	6.46	1.50	6.20
975 Restaurants	1.45	3.82	1.08	3.07	3.33	7.25	1.42	4.04	1.18	2.79	0.84	2.24
Group III Average *	\$0.56	\$1.48	\$0.36	\$1.88	\$0.91	\$1.76	\$0.61	\$1.73	\$0.32	\$1.39	\$0.34	\$1.39
Combined Average - All Groups *	\$0.96	\$2.54	\$0.70	\$3.58	\$1.59	\$2.95	\$1.03	\$2.93	\$0.58	\$2.52	\$0.57	\$2.44

<sup>\* -</sup> Averages Computed Using Delaware Payrolls by Classification as Weights